Internally-headed relative clauses in Shan*

Mary Moroney, Cornell University
mrm366@cornell.edu
@MaryTheLinguist
http://conf.ling.cornell.edu/mmoroney/
June 9, 2017

1 Introduction

- Shan is a Southwestern Tai language spoken in parts of Myanmar, Thailand, India, China,
  and Laos (Glick and Moeng 1991).
- Shan can form relative clauses in the same way as Thai, another Southwestern Tai language,
  as shown in (1-2).1,2

   book COMP 1.SG see this 3.SG red
   ‘A book that I see is red.’
   (Shan; 2016.05.10.P.MM.07b)

   book COMP 1.SG see this 3.SG red
   ‘This book that I see is red.’
   (Thai; 2016.09.28.MM.06)

- This is called a post-head relative clause, where the relative clause (an1 haw4 han1 ‘that I see’) follows the head—the noun (lik3 ‘book’) that it modifies.
- Unlike Thai, Shan also allows internally headed relative clauses (IHRCs), as shown in (3-4) where the head appears inside the relative clause itself.

1 Thanks to Ayê Twei Soe, Sireemas Maspong, and Ngampit Jagacinski who provided the Shan and Thai data. Thanks also to my committee members, John Whitman, Molly Diesing, and Sarah Murray, and the Spring 2017 Research Workshop for all their feedback. Any errors are my own.
4 The data on Shan comes primarily from my fieldwork on Shan working with a Shan speaker in Ithaca, NY from January 2016 to present. My Shan consultant is from Kayin (Karen) State in Myanmar and speaks the Yiyun Shan dialect—which is very different from the Taunggyi dialect. She also speaks Karen and received her education in Burmese. She has been in the United States for 5 years and speaks English, as well. Data was collected using a variety of elicitation methods: direct translation, grammaticality judgments, telling short stories, felicity judgments on grammatical sentences in specific contexts.

2 Types of relative clauses

- Relative clauses are clauses used to modify a noun, called the head of the relative clause.
- These constructions are classified in terms of where the head appears with respect to the clause:
  - Externally headed relative clauses (EHRCs): The head appears outside of the clause.
    * Post-head: The clause appears after the head.
    * Pre-head: The clause appears before the head.
  - Internally headed relative clauses (IHRCs): The head appears inside of the clause.

5 Post-head relative, EHRC

book COMP 1.SG see this 3.SG red

‘This book that I see is red.’
(Thai; 2016.09.28.MM.06)
3 Shan relative clauses

3.1 Distinguishing between types of Shan relative clauses

- Shan has fairly strict SVO word order, as in (8).

(8) Haw4 han1 lik3.
1.sg see book
‘I see a book.’ (Shan; 2016.03.22.PRH.05)

- In forming a relative clause, the head will appear in the position required by the relative clause construction rather than where it would appear within the relative clause if it were instead a matrix/independent clause.

- To determine the position of the head with respect to the clause—and thus classify the RC type—it is necessary to determine the boundaries of the clause.

- If the head is the subject of the RC, it would have the form head verb object and could be analyzed as [head [verb object]] (a post-head RC) or [head [verb object]] (an IHRC).

- If the head is the object of the RC, it would have the form subject verb head and could be analyzed as [[subject verb] head] (a pre-head RC) or [[subject verb head]] (an IHRC).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post-head RC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-head RC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internally headed RC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 RC head as matrix subject

- For a translation of a relative clause with the head as the matrix subject, the first version offered was a internally headed relative, as in (12).

(12) [[An1 Nan3 Li3 sUU4 kaj2 wan3naj5] man4 pen1 sii1 khaaw1. COMP Nan Li bought chicken today 3.sg be color white ‘A chicken Nan Li bought today was white.’ (Shan III; 2017.03.07.MM.04a)

- The post-head relative clause, as in (13), was also acceptable.

(13) Nan3 Li3 sUU4 kaj2 wan3naj5. Nan Li buy chicken today ‘Nan Li bought a chicken today.’ (Shan; 2017.03.21.26-27)

- In the following sections, these words are used to identify the types of Shan relative clauses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>head an1 verb object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>an1 head verb object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>subject verb wan3naj5 head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>subject verb head wan3naj5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3 Example

<insert example from the text here>
Maximality

- There are two broad patterns of interpretation of IHRCs:
  - Restrictive/intersective/non-maximal: Lakhota
  - Maximalizing: Quechua, Japanese

3.3 RC head as matrix object

- In addition to the elicited IHRCs, in (16) is an example of what is likely to be an IHRC from Saj3 Luk3

  There are two broad patterns of interpretation of IHRCs:
  - Restrictive/intersective/non-maximal: Lakhota
  - Maximalizing: Quechua, Japanese

- In addition to the elicited IHRCs, in (16) is an example of what is likely to be an IHRC from story told by my consultant.

  Shan, which lacks overt articles, would be expected to have maximalizing IHRCs.

(17) [[Thaspa] wazi taya yuza pi] cha] wachi
    apple a-IRR well wash PL SM I-want
    ‘I want an apple (nonspecific) that is well washed.’

    (Lakhota; Grosu & Landman 1998: (92a))

(18) [Nuna ishkay bestya-ta ranti-shqa-n] alli bestya-m ka-rqo-n
    man two horse-ACC buy-PERF-3 good horse-VAL be-PAST-3
    ‘The two horses that the man bought were good horses.’
    Unavailable interpretation: ‘Two horses that the man bought were good horses.’

    (Quechua; Grosu & Landman 1998: (93a))

(19) Nan3 Li3 khaj3 cin1 [an1 Saj3 Kham3 ti3 lang4 man02 naj5]. Man4 khaj3 cin1
    Nan Li want eat COMP Saj Kham will wash apple this 3.SG want eat hwi4.
    CL ROUND
    ‘Nan Li wants to eat an apple that Saj Kham will wash. She wants to eat one.’

    (Shan; 2017.05.02.MM.30)

Non-maximal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-maximal</th>
<th>Maximal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Diagram" /></td>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Diagram" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Externally headed restrictive relative clauses have an intersective/non-maximal interpretation
- Grosu & Landman (1998) note that this difference correlates to the presence (Lakhota) or absence (Quechua/Japanese) of an overt D
- Shan, which lacks overt articles, would be expected to have maximalizing IHRCs.
• Though Shan lacks overt determiners, its IHRCs appear to allow non-maximal interpretations, giving a counterexample to the correlation noted by Grosu & Landman (1998).

5 Analysis

• Since maximality is not something that my analysis needs to account for I can propose a simple raising analysis, often used for externally headed relative clauses. 5
• The head of the clause is generated inside the relative clause and then moves to the SpecCP.
• In post-head relatives, this takes place overtly, and in IHRCs, this would take place at LF.
• This sort of analysis can get the intersective/non-maximal interpretation of relative clauses.
• The trees depicting this analysis can be seen in Appendix A.

5.1 Positive predictions

This head-raising analysis:
• Can capture the non-maximizing, intersective interpretation of Shan relative clauses.
• Predicts that Shan IHRCs are subject to island constraints, which appears correct, as in (20).
• Predicts that internally headed relative clauses can have definite heads, as shown in (21-22).
  – This goes against what many people beginning with Williamson (1987) have argued, namely that relative clause heads in IHRCs are not allowed to be definite.

(20) *An1 Nan3 Li3 waa3 kam3 dahan3 an1 kong1 an2 lik3 naj5 man4 IEng1. COMP Nan Li talk together with COMP person read book this 3.SG red intended: ‘The book that Nan Li talked to the person who read (it) is red.’ (Shan: 2017.05.30.MM.14)

(21) Saj3 Kham3 aw2 [an1 Nan3 Li3 boq5saw1 maa1 to2 naj5 dahan3 maj5 Saj Kham take COMP Nan Li hit dog CL.ANIM this and/or with stick wan3naaj5], today ‘Saj Kham took this dog that Nan Li hit with a stick today.’ (Shan: 2017.03.07.MM.25a)

(22) [an1 mam05 an1 naj5 lang4 yaaw2 naj5 mi3 nuu3 lik3, AN apple AN this wash PERF this exist on book ‘This apple that is already washed is on the book.’ (Shan: 2017.05.02.MM.05)

5.2 Untested predictions

• This analysis also makes some predictions that might need to be ruled out:
  – Internally headed relative clauses can have base generated external quantifiers.
  – Externally headed relative clauses can strand CL + Dem in the relative clause:

6 Conclusion

• Using certain words to identify the right and left edges of the relative clause, I have classified the types of relative clauses found in Shan.
• I have presented data on two types of Shan relative clauses: post-head and internally-headed relatives.
• The appearance of internally headed relative clauses is surprising since the construction is somewhat typologically unexpected and is not found in related Tai languages.
• Shan has non-maximizing internally headed relative clauses, despite the fact that the language lacks overt articles.
• A head-raising analysis makes several predictions about Shan, some of which seem to be borne out and some of which need to be tested with future fieldwork.
• Other future work would be to investigate the connection between IHRC maximality and island sensitivity. Several accounts (e.g., Grosu 2002; Watanabe 2004) have connected the maximality of IHRCs to island sensitivity. Shan appears to be a counterexample.

References


A  Details of analysis

A.1  Relative clauses

- For post-head relatives, the NP moves into the SpecCP of the relative clause, as in (23).

(23)  Post-head RC with internal quantifier

- When there is quantificational material modifying the head outside of the clause, it could either be analyzed as having the quantifier generated outside the relative clause, as in (25), or having the quantifier generated inside the clause and move to SpecCP along with the head NP.

(24)  IH RC with internal quantifier: LF movement

- For IHRCs, the head still moves to SpecCP, but this happens at LF, as in (24).

(25)  Post-head RC with external quantifier: Base generate Q
Given that it is possible for there to be one quantifier inside the clause and one outside the clause, as in (26-27), the surface base generation analysis will work best.

(26) [Saj3 Kham3 bO5 mamO5 khun1 naj5] Nan3 Li3 cin1 pen3 mvmO5. Saj Kham peel apple half this Nan Li eat ASP all ‘Nan Li ate all of the half of the apples that Saj Kham peeled.’ (Shan III; 2017.24.01.MM.25a)

(27) Nan3 Li3 cin1 mamO5 mvmO5 [an1  Saj3 Kham3 bO5 khun1 naj5]. Nan Li eat apple all COMP Saj Kham peel half this ‘Nan Li ate all of the half of the apples that Saj Kham peeled.’ (Shan Post; 2017.24.01.MM.25b)

(28) **Base generated external quantifier**

---

B **Quantifier Scope**

- Shimoyama (1999) makes the claim that in Japanese quantifiers are interpreted within the clause they appear.
- Hastings (2004) claims that in Cuzco Quechua one class of quantifiers (‘strong quantifiers’) is interpreted within the matrix clause and another class (‘weak quantifiers’) is interpreted within the relative clause regardless of where the quantifier appears.
- Shan quantifiers appear to take scope within the clause they appear.

(29) Nan3 Li3 cin1 pen3 [mamO5 saam1 hwi4 [CP an1  Saj3 Kham3 bO5] naj5]. Nan Li eat ASP apple three CL.ROUND COMP Saj Kham peel this ‘Nan Li ate three apples that Saj Kham peeled.’ (Shan Post; 2017.02.28.MM.14)

- Number of apples Saj Kham peeled: at least 3
- Apples Nan Li ate: 3 of the peeled apples

(30) Nan3 Li3 cin1 pen3 [mamO5 [CP an1  Saj3 Kham3 bO5 saam1 hwi4] naj5]. Nan Li eat ASP apple COMP Saj Kham peel three CL.ROUND this ‘Nan Li ate apples that Saj Kham peeled which are three in number.’ (Shan Post; 2017.02.28.MM.17)

- Number of apples Saj Kham peeled: 3
- Apples Nan Li ate: some number of the peeled apples

(31) Nan3 Li3 cin1 pen3 [[[CP an1  Saj3 Kham3 bO5 mamO5 saam1 hwi4] naj5]. Nan Li eat ASP COMP Saj Kham peel apple three CL.ROUND this ‘Nan Li ate apples that Saj Kham peeled which are three in number.’ (Shan III; 2017.02.28.MM.13)

- Number of apples Saj Kham peeled: 3
- Apples Nan Li ate: some number of the peeled apples